Wilson Fermions and QCD at Nonzero Isospin Chemical Potential

Jacobus Verbaarschot

jacobus.verbaarschot@stonybrook.edu

Hirschegg, January 2016

Stony Brook University
Acknowledgments

Collaborators: Oliver Janssen (NYU)
Mario Kieburg (Stony Brook)
Bertram Klein (TU München)
Kim Splittorff (NBI)
Misha Stephanov (UIC)
Dominique Toublan (J.P. Morgan)
Savvas Zafeiropoulos (Stony Brook)
References


Contents

I. QCD at Nonzero Isospin Chemical Potential

II. Phases of the Wilson Dirac Operator

III. The Wilson Dirac Operator at Nonzero Isospin Chemical Potential

VI. Conclusions
Motivation

- QCD at nonzero baryon chemical potential cannot be simulated on the lattice, but phase quenched QCD, also known as QCD at nonzero isospin chemical potential, can be simulated by probabilistic methods.

- Large pion densities may occur in neutron stars and heavy ion collisions.

- A better understanding of discretization errors helps us to extrapolate to the continuum limit.

- Nuclear matter as a theory of pions.
I. QCD at Nonzero Isospin Chemical Potential

Basic physics

Dirac spectra

Chiral Lagrangian
QCD at Nonzero Isospin Chemical Potential

\[ Z_{\text{QCD}}(m, \mu_I, T) = \sum_k e^{-\beta(E_k - n_k \mu_I)}, \]

where \( n_k \) is the isospin charge of state \( k \).

- The lightest states are the pions with \( E_k/n_k = m_\pi/2 \).

- When \( \mu_I < m_\pi/2 \) only states with \( n_k = 0 \) contribute to the low temperature partition function, and the partition function does not depend on \( \mu_I \).

- The chiral condensate does not depend on \( \mu_I \) for \( \mu_I < m_\pi/2 \).

- The pion masses are \( \mu_I \)-dependent. The pole mass of the charged pions follows from \( -(p_0 - \mu_I)^2 + m_\pi^2 = 0 \), so that the charged pions behave as \( m_{\pi_k}(\mu) = m_{\pi_k} + q_k \mu_I \).
For $\mu > m_\pi/2$ it is advantageous to create as many pions as possible, and they Bose condense.

With a repulsive two-body interaction we have

$$E_{\text{vac}} = \frac{n_I}{2} m_\pi + \frac{c_I}{2} n_I^2,$$

so that

$$\mu_I = \frac{dE_{\text{vac}}}{d\mu_I} = \frac{1}{2} m_\pi + c_I n_I.$$
QCD at Nonzero Isospin Chemical Potential

QCD at nonzero isospin chemical potential is the same as QCD at nonzero baryon chemical potential with the fermion determinant replaced by its absolute value (the phase quenched QCD partition function),

\[
Z_{\text{QCD}}(\mu_I) = \langle \det(D + m + \mu_I \gamma_0) \det(D + m - \mu_I \gamma_0) \rangle
\]

\[
= \langle |\det(D + m + \mu_I \gamma_0)|^2 \rangle.
\]

Alford-Kapustin-Wilczek-1999

Therefore this partition function can be simulated on the lattice using probabilistic methods. A phase transition to a Bose condensed phase takes place at \( \mu = m_\pi / 2 \).

Phase diagram of QCD at nonzero isospin chemical potential (de Forcrand-Stephanov-Wenger-2007).
Agrees with earlier work by Kogut and Sinclair.
Lattice QCD Dirac Spectra at $\mu_I \neq 0$

The absolute value of the fermion determinant does not affect the eigenvalue density of the Dirac operator very much, and behaves the same as the eigenvalue density of the quenched Dirac operator.

The Dirac operator at nonzero chemical potential $D = \gamma_{\nu}D_{\nu} + \mu \gamma_0$ is nonhermitian with eigenvalues scattered in the complex plane.

Barbour et al. 1986

Scatter plot of Dirac eigenvalues
Interpretation of the Condensation Phase Transition in Terms of Dirac Spectra

$$\mu^2 = \frac{1}{4} m^2 = \frac{m \Sigma}{2F^2},$$

can also be written as

$$m = \frac{2\mu^2 F^2}{\Sigma}.$$

The same result is obtained from a mean field analysis of the phase quenched partition function.

Toublan-JV-2000
Normal phase: \( SU_L(2) \times SU_R(2) \rightarrow SU_V(2) \)

The Isospin chemical potential occurs as \( \mu_I \tau_3 \) and breaks \( SU_V(2) \rightarrow U_V(1) \).

In the condensed phase, the chiral condensate becomes charged under isospin and spontaneously breaks \( U_V(1) \). This gives rise to one exactly massless Goldstone boson.
Chiral Lagrangian

In the limit of light quark masses, QCD at nonzero isospin chemical potential reduces to a theory of pions interacting by a chiral Lagrangian.

The chemical potential appears in the QCD Lagrangain as an imaginary vector potential. The QCD partition function is invariant under local gauge transformations of this vector potential, and the chiral Lagrangian also should have this gauge invariance resulting in

\[
\mathcal{L} = \frac{F_\pi^2}{4} \text{Tr} \nabla_\mu U \nabla_\mu U^\dagger - \frac{1}{2} m \Sigma \text{Tr}(U + U^\dagger),
\]

\[
\nabla_0 \Sigma = \partial_0 \Sigma - \frac{1}{2} \mu_I [\tau_3, \Sigma].
\]


The important point is that the chemical potential does not introduce extra parameters.
Figure 5: Isospin chemical potential over isospin density at zero temperature and baryon chemical potential in comparison to the lattice data from Ref. [17]. The isospin densities are rescaled here to adjust to the lattice parameters. This mainly compensates for the larger pion mass and decay constant on the lattice.
II. Phases of Wilson Fermions

Spectral Properties of Wilson Fermions

Aoki Phase

First Order Scenario
Wilson Dirac operator

Wilson introduced the Wilson term to eliminate doublers

\[ D_W = \frac{1}{2} \gamma_\mu (\nabla_\mu + \nabla^*_\mu) - \frac{1}{2} a \nabla^*_\mu \nabla_\mu \equiv D + W. \]

\[ \{ D_W, \gamma_5 \} \neq 0. \]

\[ D_W = \gamma_5 D_W^\dagger \gamma_5. \]

Block structure

\[ D_W = \begin{pmatrix} aA & id \\ id^\dagger & aB \end{pmatrix} \]

with \( A^\dagger = A, \ B^\dagger = B. \)
Gap of the Wilson Dirac Spectrum

Structure of the Wilson Dirac operator

\[
D_W = \begin{pmatrix}
aA & C \\
-C^\dagger & aB
\end{pmatrix}
\]

with \( A^\dagger = A \), \( B^\dagger = B \).

For \( a = 0 \) we have that \( \gamma_5(D_W + m) = \begin{pmatrix} m & C \\
C^\dagger & m \end{pmatrix} \).

By diagonalizing \( C \) we find that the eigenvalues are given by

\[
(m - \lambda)(-m - \lambda) - c_k^*c_k = 0 \quad \implies \quad \lambda = \pm \sqrt{m^2 + c_k^*c_k}
\]

That is why \( \gamma_5(D_W + m) \) has a gap \([-m, m]\) for \( a = 0 \). For \( a \neq 0 \) states intrude inside the gap.
Spectrum of the Hermitian Wilson Dirac Operator

\[ D_5 \equiv \gamma_5 (D_W + m) = D_5^\dagger. \]

The eigenvalues of \( D_5 \) are NOT paired as \( \pm \lambda_k \).
Lattice Results for the Wilson Dirac Spectrum

Spectral density of $\gamma_5(D_W + m)$ on a $48 \times 24^3$ lattice. Lüscher-2007

- Dirac spectrum has a gap.
- A Gaussian tail intrudes inside the gap.
Phase Transition for Wilson Fermions

- A phase transition occurs when the quark mass hits the cloud of eigenvalues.

- Since $\det D_W = \det \gamma_5 D_W$, the gap of the Hermitian Dirac operator has to close as well at this point.

- The new phase is known as the Aoki phase.
Onset of the Aoki Phase

A second order phase transition to the Aoki phase occurs at $m^2_\pi = 8W a^2$.

(Used units where $m^2_\pi = m$)
At nonzero chemical potential we still have that \( \{\gamma_5, D(\mu)\} = 0 \) so that the complex eigenvalues of \( D(\mu) \) occurs in pairs \( \pm \lambda_k \).

Because \( D_W^\dagger = \gamma_5 D_W \gamma_5 \), its complex eigenvalues occur in complex conjugate pairs.

The spectrum of \( D_W \) is not constrained by the imaginary axis and can fluctuate perpendicular to this axis.
Since $\gamma_5 D_W$ is Hermitian, the two flavor partition function is positive definite and can be simulated by probabilistic methods.

When the gap is closed, the condensate corresponding to $\gamma_5 D_W$ is given by the discontinuity

$$\text{Tr} \frac{1}{\gamma_5 (D_W + m) + is} - \text{Tr} \frac{1}{\gamma_5 (D_W + m) - is}$$

$$= \sum_k \frac{-2is}{\chi_k^2 + s^2}$$

$$= -2\pi i \rho(0).$$

This corresponds to the chiral condensate

$$\langle \bar{\psi} \gamma_5 \tau_3 \psi \rangle \neq 0.$$
Therefore the vector symmetry is broken spontaneously according to

\[ SU_V(2) \rightarrow U_V(1). \]

Therefore, the Aoki phase has two massless Goldstone bosons with a nonzero isospin charge.
This argument assumes that the fermion determinant does not affect the cloud of eigenvalues. Therefore, in the quenched case, there always is a transition to the Aoki phase in the approach to the chiral limit.

For dynamical fermions there will be a feedback from the fermion determinant. Configurations with eigenvalues close to the quark mass are suppressed.

However, the Wilson Dirac operator is nonhermitian and eigenvalues are not constrained to the imaginary axis in any way.
First Order Scenario and Dirac Spectra

- Because of the fermion determinant the eigenvalues will be repelled from the quark mass.

- The eigenvalues of the Wilson Dirac operator can move perpendicular to the imaginary axis.

- When the quark mass crosses zero the Dirac spectrum jumps to the other side of the imaginary axis. This results in a first order phase transition.

- This is known as the first order scenario.

Sharpe-Singleton-1998
The fuzzy string of eigenvalues cannot move through the mass because the fermion determinant would vanish at this point. This gives a first order phase transition.

Because the Dirac eigenvalues are at a finite distance from the quark mass, the pion mass is always finite.
Chiral Lagrangian for Wilson Fermions

Up to low-energy constants, the chiral Lagrangian for Wilson fermions is uniquely determined by the transformation properties of QCD. Since the Wilson term has the same invariance properties as the mass matrix one easily finds

$$\mathcal{L} = \frac{F^2}{4} \text{Tr} \partial_\mu U \partial_\mu U^\dagger - \frac{1}{2} m V \Sigma \text{Tr}(U + U^\dagger)$$

$$+ a^2 V W_8 \text{Tr}(U^2 + U^{-2}) + a^2 W_6 [\text{Tr}(U + U^\dagger)]^2 + a^2 W_7 [\text{Tr}(U - U^\dagger)]^2.$$

Sharpe-Singleton-1998, Rupak-Shoresh-2002,
Bär-Rupak-Shoresh-2004, Damgaard-Splittorff-JV-2011

► This Lagrangian is uniquely determined by the transformation properties of the QCD partition function (spurion formalism).
III. Wilson Fermions at Nonzero Isospin Chemical Potential

Chiral Lagrangian

Symmetries

Phase Diagram
The Aoki phase has two Goldstone bosons with nonzero isospin charge.

They will condense for an infinitesimal isospin chemical potential.

In the Aoki phase the Wilson QCD partition function is nonanalytic at $\mu_I = 0$. 

It is clear how to write down the chiral Lagrangian. Just replace the derivatives in the Wilson chiral Lagrangian by covariant derivatives.

The phases of this Lagrangian can be determined by mean field theory.
What Happens to the Aoki Phase?

At nonzero isospin chemical potential, the Dirac operator

\[ \gamma_5(D_Wc + m + \mu \gamma_0) \]

becomes nonhermitian.

\[ \langle \bar{\psi} \gamma_5 \tau_3 \psi \rangle = \lim_{s \to 0} \lim_{V \to \infty} \sum_k \frac{-2is}{\lambda_k^2 + s^2} = 0. \]
A nonzero $\mu_I$ broadens the cloud of eigenvalues.

The quark mass enters the cloud of eigenvalues at

$$m_{\pi}^2 = 4\mu_I^2 + 16W a^2.$$ 

Inside this phase the $U_V(1)$ symmetry is spontaneously broken and we have one exactly massless Goldstone boson as is the case for $a = 0$. 
Phase I: Condensed phase with one exactly massless Goldstone boson.

Phase III: Normal phase

Phase II: Phase with spontaneously broken parity and isospin, but all pions are massive because $\mu_1 \tau_3$ breaks isospin. An imaginary chemical potential does not change the width of the strip of eigenvalues.

IV. Conclusions

- The phases of QCD at nonzero isospin chemical potential as well as of QCD with Wilson fermions can be understood in terms of Dirac spectra. This complements the use of chiral Lagrangians and mean field theory.
IV. Conclusions

- The phases of QCD at nonzero isospin chemical potential as well as of QCD with Wilson fermions can be understood in terms of Dirac spectra. This complements the use of chiral Lagrangians and mean field theory.

- The Aoki phase is destroyed by an infinitesimally small isospin chemical potential.
IV. Conclusions

- The phases of QCD at nonzero isospin chemical potential as well as of QCD with Wilson fermions can be understood in terms of Dirac spectra. This complements the use of chiral Lagrangians and mean field theory.

- The Aoki phase is destroyed by an infinitesimally small isospin chemical potential.

- In the chiral limit, the Wilson QCD partition function is nonanalytic at $\mu_I = 0$. 