More on Gribov copies in Landau-gauge

Axel Maas

19th of March 2008 415th W&E Heraeus Seminar: Quarks & Hadrons in Strong QCD St. Goar, Germany



• Landau gauges in the non-perturbative domain





- Landau gauges in the non-perturbative domain
- Gauge-fixing on the lattice



- Landau gauges in the non-perturbative domain
- Gauge-fixing on the lattice
- Propagators
 - Impact on the propagators in 2d
 - Impact on the propagators in 3d



- Landau gauges in the non-perturbative domain
- Gauge-fixing on the lattice
- Propagators
 - Impact on the propagators in 2d
 - Impact on the propagators in 3d
 - Calculations in 4d (yet) too expensive



Gauge-fixing

- QCD is a gauge theory with a Lie-algebra-element valued gauge-field $A_{\mu} = \tau^a A^a_{\mu}$
 - Gauge transformations change the gauge fields, but leave physics invariant: Gauge orbits

Gauge-fixing

- QCD is a gauge theory with a Lie-algebra-element valued gauge-field $A_{\mu} = \tau^a A^a_{\mu}$
 - Gauge transformations change the gauge fields, but leave physics invariant: Gauge orbits
- Correlation functions are in general gauge-dependent
 - Gauge-fixing is required



Gauge-fixing

- QCD is a gauge theory with a Lie-algebra-element valued gauge-field $A_{\mu} = \tau^a A^a_{\mu}$
 - Gauge transformations change the gauge fields, but leave physics invariant: Gauge orbits
- Correlation functions are in general gauge-dependent
 - Gauge-fixing is required
- Gauge-dependent quantities are interesting
 - Manifestation of confinement mechanism
 - Gribov-Zwanziger scenario
 - Topologial mechanisms



- In perturbation theory: Local gauge condition
 - Landau gauge: $\partial_{\mu}A^{a}_{\mu}=0$



• In perturbation theory: Local gauge condition

• Landau gauge:
$$\partial_{\mu}A^{a}_{\mu}=0$$

Sufficient for perturbation theory



• In perturbation theory: Local gauge condition

• Landau gauge:
$$\partial_{\mu}A^{a}_{\mu} = 0$$

- Sufficient for perturbation theory
- Insufficient beyond perturbation theory
 - There are gauge-equivalent configurations which obey the same local gauge-condition: Gribov copies



- In perturbation theory: Local gauge condition
 - Landau gauge: $\partial_{\mu}A^{a}_{\mu}=0$
- Sufficient for perturbation theory
- Insufficient beyond perturbation theory
 - There are gauge-equivalent configurations which obey the same local gauge-condition: Gribov copies
- There are no Known local gauge conditions, which lead to a unique gauge configuration
 - Non-local conditions possible, but impractical outside lattice gauge theory



- Impose Landau gauge condition
 - Reduces configuration space to a hypersurface

- Impose Landau gauge condition
 - Reduces configuration space to a hypersurface
- Leaves the non-perturbative gauge freedom to choose between gauge-equivalent Gribov copies: Residual gauge orbit



- Impose Landau gauge condition
 - Reduces configuration space to a hypersurface
- Leaves the non-perturbative gauge freedom to choose between gauge-equivalent Gribov copies: Residual gauge orbit
- If a complete gauge-fixing is required, this freedom has to be fixed
 - There is no unique prescription how to complete Landau gauge nonperturbatively
 - There is no possibility using a local condition to restrict to one representative of the residual gauge orbit



- Impose Landau gauge condition
 - Reduces configuration space to a hypersurface
- Leaves the non-perturbative gauge freedom to choose between gauge-equivalent Gribov copies: Residual gauge orbit
- If a complete gauge-fixing is required, this freedom has to be fixed
 - There is no unique prescription how to complete Landau gauge nonperturbatively
 - There is no possibility using a local condition to restrict to one representative of the residual gauge orbit
- Choice: Leave the global color symmetry unfixed



• Three examples



- Three examples:
- Take the representative inside the fundamental modular region
 - Landau-Landau-type or absolute Landau gauge



- Three examples:
- Take the representative inside the fundamental modular region
 - Landau-Landau-type or absolute Landau gauge
- Average over (part of) the residual gauge orbit
 - Landau-Feynman-type



- Three examples:
- Take the representative inside the fundamental modular region
 - Landau-Landau-type or absolute Landau gauge
- Average over (part of) the residual gauge orbit
 - Landau-Feynman-type
 - Average over the complete residual orbit: Hirschfeld-like

- Three examples:
- Take the representative inside the fundamental modular region
 - Landau-Landau-type or absolute Landau gauge
- Average over (part of) the residual gauge orbit
 - Landau-Feynman-type
 - Average over the complete residual orbit: Hirschfeld-like
 - Average over the elements in the first Gribov region: Minimal Landau gauge

Slides left: 17 (in this section: 2)

• Do all these gauges differ on the level of correlation functions?



- Do all these gauges differ on the level of correlation functions?
 - Zwanzigers conjecture: In an infinite volume minimal and absolute Landau gauge should coincide
 - Only for operators with a finite product of gluon field operators
 - Ghost correlation functions are determined by the inverse Faddeev-Popov operator - involve an infinite number!
 - Approach to the limit?



- Do all these gauges differ on the level of correlation functions?
 - Zwanzigers conjecture: In an infinite volume minimal and absolute Landau gauge should coincide
 - Only for operators with a finite product of gluon field operators
 - Ghost correlation functions are determined by the inverse Faddeev-Popov operator - involve an infinite number!
 - Approach to the limit?
 - Does not apply to lattice calculations in a finite volume



- Do all these gauges differ on the level of correlation functions?
 - Zwanzigers conjecture: In an infinite volume minimal and absolute Landau gauge should coincide
 - Only for operators with a finite product of gluon field operators
 - Ghost correlation functions are determined by the inverse Faddeev-Popov operator - involve an infinite number!
 - Approach to the limit?
 - Does not apply to lattice calculations in a finite volume
- Here:
 - Compare absolute and minimal Landau gauge



Gauge fixing – Lattice – 2d – 3d – Summary

Configuration space (artist's view)



Configuration space (artist's view)

- Impose Landau gauge condition
 - Reduces configuration space to a hypersurface
 - Only residual gauge orbits left



• Minimal Landau gauge



Gauge fixing - Lattice - 2d - 3d - Summary

Configuration space (artist's view) [Gribov NPA 1978, Zwanziger 1993...2003]

- Minimal Landau gauge
- A local minium of
 - $\int d^d x A^a_\mu(x) A^a_\mu(x)$

defines the first Gribov region



- Minimal Landau gauge
- A local minium of

 $\int d^d x A^a_\mu(x) A^a_\mu(x)$

defines the first Gribov region

- There the Faddeev-Popov operator
 - $-\partial_{\mu}(\partial_{\mu} g A_{\mu})$

is positive semi-definite



- Minimal Landau gauge
- A local minium of

 $\int d^d x A^a_\mu(x) A^a_\mu(x)$

defines the first Gribov region

• There the Faddeev-Popov operator

 $-\partial_{\mu}(\partial_{\mu}-gA_{\mu})$

is positive semi-definite

• All propagators are positive semidefinite inside this region



Gauge fixing - Lattice - 2d - 3d - Summary



GRAZ

- Absolute Landau gauge
- A global minimum of

 $\int d^d x A^a_\mu(x) A^a_\mu(x)$

defines the fundamental modular region



- Absolute Landau gauge
- A global minimum of

 $\int d^d x A^a_\mu(x) A^a_\mu(x)$

defines the fundamental modular region

- Singles out exactly one gauge copy
 - Unique up to global transformations



- Absolute Landau gauge
- A global minimum of

 $\int d^d x A^a_\mu(x) A^a_\mu(x)$

defines the fundamental modular region

- Singles out exactly one gauge copy
 - Unique up to global transformations
- Equivalent: Take the representative of the gauge orbit, which minimizes the trace of the gluon propagator $\int dp \, D^{aa}_{\mu\mu}(p)$



Gauge-fixing on the lattice

- Take the requirement of finding an absolute minimum literally by recasting (Landau-) gauge-fixing into a minimization problem
 - Minimize $\sum_{x,\mu} (1 \Re(tr(\exp(iA_{\mu}(x)))))$


- Take the requirement of finding an absolute minimum literally by recasting (Landau-) gauge-fixing into a minimization problem
 - Minimize $\sum_{x,\mu} (1 \Re(tr(\exp(iA_{\mu}(x))))) \sim \sum_{x} A^{a}_{\mu}(x) A^{a}_{\mu}(x) + O(a^{2})$



 Take the requirement of finding an absolute minimum literally by recasting (Landau-) gauge-fixing into a minimization problem

• Minimize
$$\sum_{x,\mu} (1 - \Re(tr(\exp(iA_{\mu}(x))))) \sim \sum_{x} A_{\mu}^{a}(x) A_{\mu}^{a}(x) + O(a^{2})$$

• Any local minima guarantees to be inside the first Gribov horizon



 Take the requirement of finding an absolute minimum literally by recasting (Landau-) gauge-fixing into a minimization problem

• Minimize
$$\sum_{x,\mu} (1 - \Re(tr(\exp(iA_{\mu}(x))))) \sim \sum_{x} A_{\mu}^{a}(x) A_{\mu}^{a}(x) + O(a^{2})$$

• Any local minima guarantees to be inside the first Gribov horizon

Numerically highly complicated and unsolved

- Take the requirement of finding an absolute minimum literally by recasting (Landau-) gauge-fixing into a minimization problem
 - Minimize $\sum_{x,\mu} (1 \Re(tr(\exp(iA_{\mu}(x))))) \sim \sum_{x} A^{a}_{\mu}(x) A^{a}_{\mu}(x) + O(a^{2})$
 - Any local minima guarantees to be inside the first Gribov horizon
- Numerically highly complicated and unsolved
 - Various approximate approaches have been developed
 - Mostly used: Restart algorithms
 - Highly sophisticated methods available



- Take the requirement of finding an absolute minimum literally by recasting (Landau-) gauge-fixing into a minimization problem
 - Minimize $\sum_{x,\mu} (1 \Re(tr(\exp(iA_{\mu}(x))))) \sim \sum_{x} A_{\mu}^{a}(x) A_{\mu}^{a}(x) + O(a^{2})$
 - Any local minima guarantees to be inside the first Gribov horizon
- Numerically highly complicated and unsolved
 - Various approximate approaches have been developed
 - Mostly used: Restart algorithms
 - Highly sophisticated methods available
 - Here: Evolutionary algorithm



- Take the requirement of finding an absolute minimum literally by recasting (Landau-) gauge-fixing into a minimization problem
 - Minimize $\sum_{x,\mu} (1 \Re(tr(\exp(iA_{\mu}(x))))) \sim \sum_{x} A_{\mu}^{a}(x) A_{\mu}^{a}(x) + O(a^{2})$
 - Any local minima guarantees to be inside the first Gribov horizon
- Numerically highly complicated and unsolved
 - Various approximate approaches have been developed
 - Mostly used: Restart algorithms
 - Highly sophisticated methods available
 - Here: Evolutionary algorithm
 - Very versatile and adapts to a configuration
 - Takes lattice Gribov copies also into account
 - Particular advanatge: Lower dimensionality



 Correct solution unknown - no reliable measure of gauge-fixing quality exists



- Correct solution unknown no reliable measure of gauge-fixing quality exists
- Measure the difference D between the shallowest and deepest minimum found
 - Correlates acceptable with the impact on correlation functions



- Correct solution unknown no reliable measure of gauge-fixing quality exists
- Measure the difference D between the shallowest and deepest minimum found
 - Correlates acceptable with the impact on correlation functions
- Dependence on volume, discretization and dimensionality



- Correct solution unknown no reliable measure of gauge-fixing quality exists
- Measure the difference D between the shallowest and deepest minimum found
 - Correlates acceptable with the impact on correlation functions
- Dependence on volume, discretization and dimensionality
 - Number of Gribov copies grows exponentially with volume [Zwanziger 1993...2003]



- Correct solution unknown no reliable measure of gauge-fixing quality exists
- Measure the difference D between the shallowest and deepest minimum found
 - Correlates acceptable with the impact on correlation functions
- Dependence on volume, discretization and dimensionality
 - Number of Gribov copies grows exponentially with volume [Zwanziger 1993...2003]
 - NP-complete problem All gauge-fixing algorithms will require an amount of time to find the absolute minimum which grows exponentially with volume
 - No termination criterion Known



Artifact-dependence of Gribov copies [Maas, unpublished]

Quality measure as a function of volume



- Strong (exponental) increase with volume before saturation in 3d
- Small impact of discretization

GRAZ

Artifact-dependence of Gribov copies [Maas, unpublished]



• Strong (exponental) increase with volume before saturation in 3d

- Small impact of discretization
- Gribov effect significantly weaker in two dimensions

GRAZ

Impact on the propagators

- Propagators are the (inverse) 2-point function
 - Zwanzigers conjecture applies to the gluon propagator



Impact on the propagators

- Propagators are the (inverse) 2-point function
 - Zwanzigers conjecture applies to the gluon propagator
- Important quantities
 - Describe gluons
 - Non-perturbative information are encoded



• In Landau gauge: Gluon and one auxiliary field: Ghost



- In Landau gauge: Gluon and one auxiliary field: Ghost
- Gluon:

$$D_{\mu\nu}^{ab}(x-y) = \langle A_{\mu}^{a}(x) A_{\nu}^{b}(y) \rangle$$
$$D_{\mu\nu}(p) = (\delta_{\mu\nu} - \frac{p_{\mu}p_{\nu}}{p^{2}}) \frac{Z(p)}{p^{2}}$$



- In Landau gauge: Gluon and one auxiliary field: Ghost
- Gluon:

$$D_{\mu\nu}^{ab}(x-y) = \langle A_{\mu}^{a}(x) A_{\nu}^{b}(y) \rangle$$
$$D_{\mu\nu}(p) = (\delta_{\mu\nu} - \frac{p_{\mu}p_{\nu}}{p^{2}}) \frac{Z(p)}{p^{2}}$$

• Ghost:

$$D_G^{ab}(x-y) = \langle \overline{c}^a(x) c^b(y) \rangle$$
$$D_G(p) = \frac{-G(p)}{p^2}$$



- In Landau gauge: Gluon and one auxiliary field: Ghost
- Gluon:

$$D_{\mu\nu}^{ab}(x-y) = \langle A_{\mu}^{a}(x) A_{\nu}^{b}(y) \rangle$$
$$D_{\mu\nu}(p) = (\delta_{\mu\nu} - \frac{p_{\mu}p_{\nu}}{p^{2}}) \frac{Z(p)}{p^{2}}$$

• Ghost:

$$D_G^{ab}(x-y) = \langle \overline{c}^a(x) c^b(y) \rangle$$
$$D_G(p) = \frac{-G(p)}{p^2}$$

• Ghost linked to the Faddeev-Popov operator

$$D_{G}^{ab}(x-y) \sim \langle (\partial_{\mu} D_{\mu}^{ab})^{-1} \rangle = \langle (\partial_{\mu} (\delta^{ab} \partial_{\mu} - g f^{abc} A_{\mu}^{c}))^{-1} \rangle$$



Minimal Landau gauge in two dimensions

• Results in minimal Landau gauge:

[Maas 2007]

- Gluon propagator infrared vanishing
- Ghost propagator infrared enhanced wrt tree-level
- Both behave as power-laws in the far infrared



Minimal Landau gauge in two dimensions

• Results in minimal Landau gauge:

[Maas 2007]

- Gluon propagator infrared vanishing
- Ghost propagator infrared enhanced wrt tree-level
- Both behave as power-laws in the far infrared
- Quantitative agreement with predictions from functional calculations [Lerche et al. 2002, Zwanziger 2002, Huber et al. 2007, Pawlowski et al. 2004]



Gluon propagator

Impact on the propagators [1042, beta=38.7, Maas, unpublished]

g²D(p) Without correction Gribov corrected 0.8 0.6 0.4 0.2 **0** 0.5 1.5 2 2.5 3 3.5 p/g

Essentially no impact on the gluon propagator

Possibly even stronger infrared suppressed





Essentially no impact on the gluon propagator

- Possibly even stronger infrared suppressed
- Ghost propagator somewhat less enhanced



Gauge fixing - Lattice - 2d - 3d - Summary

Impact on the propagators [1042, beta=38.7, Maas, unpublished]





Slides left: 8 (in this section: 1)



Impact on the propagators

[104², beta=38.7, Maas, unpublished]







- Exponent in both cases compatible with predictions
- Finite volume correction much less severe in the absolute Landau gauge

GRAZ

Absolute Landau gauge in two dimensions

- Gluon propagator even more infrared suppressed
 - Within errors still compatible with predictions



Absolute Landau gauge in two dimensions

- Gluon propagator even more infrared suppressed
 - Within errors still compatible with predictions
- Ghost propagator less suppressed
 - Within errors still compatible with predictions
 - Finite volume corrections less severe



Absolute Landau gauge in two dimensions

- Gluon propagator even more infrared suppressed
 - Within errors still compatible with predictions
- Ghost propagator less suppressed
 - Within errors still compatible with predictions
 - Finite volume corrections less severe
- Predicted relation between gluon and ghost infrared behavior seems to be still valid
 - More statistics and volume needed



Minimal Landau gauge in three dimensions

• Same qualitative predictions as in two dimensions

[Lerche et al. 2002, Zwanziger 2002, Huber et al. 2007, Pawlowski et al. 2004]

Vanishing gluon propagator and enhanced ghost propagator



Minimal Landau gauge in three dimensions

• Same qualitative predictions as in two dimensions

[Lerche et al. 2002, Zwanziger 2002, Huber et al. 2007, Pawlowski et al. 2004]

- Vanishing gluon propagator and enhanced ghost propagator
- Lattice results in the asymptotic regime [Cucchieri, et al. 2007/2008]
 - Infrared finite gluon propagator
 - Tree-level-like ghost



Minimal Landau gauge in three dimensions

• Same qualitative predictions as in two dimensions

[Lerche et al. 2002, Zwanziger 2002, Huber et al. 2007, Pawlowski et al. 2004]

- Vanishing gluon propagator and enhanced ghost propagator
- Lattice results in the asymptotic regime [Cucchieri, et al. 2007/2008]
 - Infrared finite gluon propagator
 - Tree-level-like ghost
- Qualitative agreement to functional predictions in an intermediate momentum window



Gauge fixing - Lattice - 2d - 3d - Summary



Impact on the ghost propagator [403, beta=4.24, Maas, unpublished]

Slides left: 5 (in this section: 3)

GRAZ



Gauge fixing - Lattice - 2d - 3d - Summary



Impact on the ghost propagator [403, beta=4.24, Maas, unpublished]

- Impact rate depends likely non-monotonically on the volume
- Asymptotic limit? Finite volume artifacts more intricate than in two dimensions

Gribov copies/Axel Maas





- Small effect
 - Most pronounced in the far infrared, and decays with increasing momentum

GRAZ

Impact on the gluon propagator [Maas, unpublished]



 Changes the asymptotic behavior of the gluon propagator at zero momentum

Gribov copies/Axel Maas



Absolute Landau gauge in three dimensions

• Effects seen at least up to a scale of ³/₄ GeV


Absolute Landau gauge in three dimensions

- Effects seen at least up to a scale of ³/₄ GeV
- Gribov impact does not (yet?) diminish with volume
 - Volumes are larger than $(10 \text{ fm})^3$

Absolute Landau gauge in three dimensions

- Effects seen at least up to a scale of ³/₄ GeV
- Gribov impact does not (yet?) diminish with volume
 - Volumes are larger than $(10 \text{ fm})^3$
- Gluon propagator stronger infrared suppressed
 - Gauge requirement of minimal gluon propagator is even fulfilled locally
 - Possibly infrared vanishing
- Ghost propagator strongly affected asymptotic limit unclear
- Quantitative and qualitative impact



• Differences become more pronounced with increasing volume so far





- Differences become more pronounced with increasing volume so far
- Nearly no impact in two dimensions
 - Agreement between functional and lattice results



- Differences become more pronounced with increasing volume so far
- Nearly no impact in two dimensions
 - Agreement between functional and lattice results
- Significant importance in three dimensions
 - Absolute Landau gauge agrees better with the continuum predictions



- Differences become more pronounced with increasing volume so far
- Nearly no impact in two dimensions
 - Agreement between functional and lattice results
- Significant importance in three dimensions
 - Absolute Landau gauge agrees better with the continuum predictions
- The larger the volume, the larger the affected momentum range



- Differences become more pronounced with increasing volume so far
- Nearly no impact in two dimensions
 - Agreement between functional and lattice results
- Significant importance in three dimensions
 - Absolute Landau gauge agrees better with the continuum predictions
- The larger the volume, the larger the affected momentum range
- In four dimensions even more impact to be expected



- Non-perturbative extensions of local gauge conditions is a nontrivial problem
 - Which gauges in the continuum and on the lattice are equivalent?



- Non-perturbative extensions of local gauge conditions is a nontrivial problem
 - Which gauges in the continuum and on the lattice are equivalent?
- Absolute and minimal Landau gauge agrees with predictions in 2d
 - Finite volume effects less severe



- Non-perturbative extensions of local gauge conditions is a nontrivial problem
 - Which gauges in the continuum and on the lattice are equivalent?
- Absolute and minimal Landau gauge agrees with predictions in 2d
 - Finite volume effects less severe
- In 3d, the absolute Landau gauge agrees better



- Non-perturbative extensions of local gauge conditions is a nontrivial problem
 - Which gauges in the continuum and on the lattice are equivalent?
- Absolute and minimal Landau gauge agrees with predictions in 2d
 - Finite volume effects less severe
- In 3d, the absolute Landau gauge agrees better
- It is necessary to clearly state the complete gauge prescription for continuum/lattice comparisons



- Non-perturbative extensions of local gauge conditions is a nontrivial problem
 - Which gauges in the continuum and on the lattice are equivalent?
- Absolute and minimal Landau gauge agrees with predictions in 2d
 - Finite volume effects less severe
- In 3d, the absolute Landau gauge agrees better
- It is necessary to clearly state the complete gauge prescription for continuum/lattice comparisons
- What happens at large volumes and in 4d?

- Non-perturbative extensions of local gauge conditions is a nontrivial problem
 - Which gauges in the continuum and on the lattice are equivalent?
- Absolute and minimal Landau gauge agrees with predictions in 2d
 - Finite volume effects less severe
- In 3d, the absolute Landau gauge agrees better
- It is necessary to clearly state the complete gauge prescription for continuum/lattice comparisons
- What happens at large volumes and in 4d?
- Which gauges lead in the continuum to the same correlation functions?



• Interpret a gauge transformation as the genetic code



- Interpret a gauge transformation as the genetic code
- Begin with a population of gauge transformations to local Landau gauge into the first Gribov region



- Interpret a gauge transformation as the genetic code
- Begin with a population of gauge transformations to local Landau gauge into the first Gribov region
- Add new gauge transformations
 - Randomly generated, but still to local Landau gauge inside the first Gribov horizon



- Interpret a gauge transformation as the genetic code
- Begin with a population of gauge transformations to local Landau gauge into the first Gribov region
- Add new gauge transformations and mix existing ones
 - Take two, which belong to the more successful population
 - Lower minimum of the gauge-fixing functional
 - \bullet Create a new one, by taking half the elements from one and the other one from the other
 - Random, which element is from which



- Interpret a gauge transformation as the genetic code
- Begin with a population of gauge transformations to local Landau gauge into the first Gribov region
- Add new gauge transformations and mix/change existing ones
 - Create a new gauge transformation by changing a copy of a successful gauge transformation randomly at a random number of points in space-time – point mutations



- Interpret a gauge transformation as the genetic code
- Begin with a population of gauge transformations to local Landau gauge into the first Gribov region
- Add new gauge transformations and mix/change existing ones and discard ineffective ones
 - The half of the ancestor generation with the hightes local minima
 - This half is replaced by the new/mixed/changed ones



- Interpret a gauge transformation as the genetic code
- Begin with a population of gauge transformations to local Landau gauge into the first Gribov region
- Add new gauge transformations and mix/change existing ones and discard ineffective ones to get a new generation



- Interpret a gauge transformation as the genetic code
- Begin with a population of gauge transformations to local Landau gauge into the first Gribov region
- Add new gauge transformations and mix/change existing ones and discard ineffective ones to get a new generation
- Repeat, until no improvement is found in a new generation

- Interpret a gauge transformation as the genetic code
- Begin with a population of gauge transformations to local Landau gauge into the first Gribov region
- Add new gauge transformations and mix/change existing ones and discard ineffective ones to get a new generation
- Repeat, until no improvement is found in a new generation
- Not guaranteed to find the absolute minimum
 - But a very successful approach in many applications
 - Requires for optimization more knowledge on the shape of local and absolute minima